# Inner approximated reachability analysis

Eric Goubault, Michel Kieffer, Olivier Mullier and Sylvie Putot

LIX & L2S - CNRS - Supélec - Univ Paris-Sud

November 24th, 2015



## Reachability of dynamical systems - central to program analysis, control theory

- Outer approximation: safety proof (but "false alarms" ?)
- Inner approximation: property falsification
- Combined inner and outer approximations: indication of the precision of estimates

## In this talk

- Inner approximation of  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}^p$  using:
  - modal intervals and Kaucher arithmetic  $(f: \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R})$
  - generalized mean value theorem
  - zonotopes for Jacobian outer approximation  $(f:\mathbb{R}^n
    ightarrow\mathbb{R}^p)$
- Applications to numerical schemes and dynamical systems analysis

This can also be applied to outer-approximation (although we have already the "usual" zonotopic approximation, that we recap a bit ; and to invariant calculations.



### Outer approximation has become classical

Intervals, zonotopes, support functions, ellipsoids etc.

### Inner approximation is much more difficult

- Linear case [Kurzhanski-Varaiya HSCC 2000, Althoff et al. CDC 2007, Kanade et al. CAV 2009]
- Simulation-based local inner approximations [Nghiem et al. HSCC 2010]
- Box bisections [Goldsztejn-Jaulin Reliable Computing 2010, Mullier-Goubault-Kieffer-Putot RC 2013]
- Parallelepipeds [Goldsztejn-Hayes SCAN 2006]
- Order 0 generalized affine forms [Goubault-Putot SAS 2007]



## Intervals, outer and inner approximations

Intervals: closed connected subsets of  $\mathbb{R}$ , noted  $[x] \in \mathbf{I}$ 

We would like to compute range $(f, [x]) = \{f(x), x \in [x]\}$ .

### Outer (or over) approximation

• An outer approximating extension of  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$  over intervals is  $[f] : \mathbf{I}^n \to \mathbf{I}$  such that

$$\forall [x] \in \mathbf{I}^n, \mathsf{range}(f, [x]) \subseteq [z] = [f]([x])$$

• Natural interval extension: replacing real by interval operations in function f.

Example: the extension of  $f(x) = x^2 - x$  on [2,3] is  $[f]([2,3]) = [2,3]^2 - [2,3] = [1,7]$ , and can be interpreted as

$$(\forall x \in [2,3]) (\exists z \in [1,7]) (f(x) = z).$$

#### Inner (or under) approximation

An interval inner approximation  $[z] \in I$  satisfies  $[z] \subseteq range(f, [x])$  of the range of f over [x], can be interpreted as

$$(\forall z \in [z]) (\exists x \in [x]) (f(x) = z).$$

# Generalized intervals for outer and inner approximations

### Generalized intervals

- Intervals whose bounds are not ordered  $\mathbf{K} = \{[a, b], a \in \mathbb{R}, b \in \mathbb{R}\}$
- Called proper if  $a \leq b$ , else improper

### Definition (Following Goldsztejn et al. 2005)

Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$  be a continuous function and  $[x] \in \mathbf{K}^n$ , decomposed in  $[x]_{\mathcal{A}} \in \mathbf{I}^p$  and  $[x]_{\mathcal{E}} \in (\text{dual } \mathbf{I})^q$  with p + q = n. A generalized interval  $[z] \in \mathbf{K}$  is (f, [x])-interpretable if

$$(\forall x_{\mathcal{A}} \in [x]_{\mathcal{A}}) (Q_z z \in \mathsf{pro} \ [z]) (\exists x_{\mathcal{E}} \in \mathsf{pro} \ [x]_{\mathcal{E}}), (f(x) = z)$$

where  $Q_z = \exists$  if [z] is proper, and  $Q_z = \forall$  if [z] is improper.

 When all intervals are proper, we get classical interval computation and an outer approximation of range(f, x)

$$(\forall x \in [x]) (\exists z \in [z]) (f(x) = z).$$

• When all intervals are improper, we get an inner approximation of range(f, [x])

$$(\forall z \in \text{pro } [z]) (\exists x \in \text{pro } [x]) (f(x) = z).$$

# Kaucher arithmetic [Kaucher 1980] on generalized intervals

Kaucher addition extends addition on classical intervals:  $[x] + [y] = [\underline{x} + \underline{y}, \overline{x} + \overline{y}]$  and  $[x] - [y] = [\underline{x} - \overline{y}, \overline{x} - \underline{y}]$ .

### Kaucher multiplication

Let  $\mathcal{P} = \{ [x] = [\underline{x}, \overline{x}], \ \underline{x} \ge 0 \land \overline{x} \ge 0 \}, \ -\mathcal{P} = \{ [x] = [\underline{x}, \overline{x}], \ \underline{x} \le 0 \land \overline{x} \le 0 \}, \ \mathcal{Z} = \{ [x] = [\underline{x}, \overline{x}], \ \underline{x} \le 0 \land \overline{x} \le 0 \}, \ \text{and dual } \mathcal{Z} = \{ [x] = [\underline{x}, \overline{x}], \ \underline{x} \ge 0 \ge \overline{x} \}.$ 



Interpretation of Kaucher arithmetic, Goldsztejn et al. 2005

Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$  be given by an arithmetic expression with single occurrences of variables. Then for  $[x] \in \mathbf{K}^n$ , f([x]), computed using Kaucher arithmetic, is (f, [x])-interpretable.

E. Goubault, M. Kieffer, O. Mullier and S. Putot (LIX

# Kaucher arithmetic [Kaucher 1980] on generalized intervals

Kaucher addition extends addition on classical intervals:  $[x] + [y] = [\underline{x} + \underline{y}, \overline{x} + \overline{y}]$  and  $[x] - [y] = [\underline{x} - \overline{y}, \overline{x} - \underline{y}].$ 

### Kaucher multiplication

Let  $\mathcal{P} = \{ [x] = [\underline{x}, \overline{x}], \ \underline{x} \ge 0 \land \overline{x} \ge 0 \}, \ -\mathcal{P} = \{ [x] = [\underline{x}, \overline{x}], \ \underline{x} \le 0 \land \overline{x} \le 0 \}, \ \mathcal{Z} = \{ [x] = [\underline{x}, \overline{x}], \ \underline{x} \le 0 \land \overline{x} \le 0 \}, \ \text{and dual } \mathcal{Z} = \{ [x] = [\underline{x}, \overline{x}], \ \underline{x} \ge 0 \ge \overline{x} \}.$ 



#### Interpretation of Kaucher arithmetic, Goldsztejn et al. 2005

Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$  be given by an arithmetic expression with single occurrences of variables. Then for  $[x] \in \mathbf{K}^n$ , f([x]), computed using Kaucher arithmetic, is (f, [x])-interpretable.

Example:  $[z] = [x] \times [y] = 0$  when  $[x] \in \mathcal{Z}$  and  $[y] \in dual \mathcal{Z}$ 

# Example: Kaucher multiplication

Example (Interpretation of the Kaucher multiplication in the case  $\mathcal{Z} \times \text{dual } \mathcal{Z}$ )  $[z] = [x] \times [y] = 0$  when  $[x] \in \mathcal{Z} = \{[x], \underline{x} \leq 0 \leq \overline{x}\}$  (e.g. [-5,4]) and  $[y] \in \text{dual } \mathcal{Z} = \{[x], \underline{x} \geq 0 \geq \overline{x}\}$  (e.g. [1,-1]).

### Definition (reminder)

Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$  and  $[x] \in \mathbf{K}^n$ , which we can decompose in  $[x]_{\mathcal{A}} \in \mathbf{I}^p$  and  $[x]_{\mathcal{E}} \in (\text{dual } \mathbf{I})^q$ with p + q = n. A generalized interval  $[z] \in \mathbf{K}$  is (f, [x])-interpretable if

$$(\forall x_{\mathcal{A}} \in [x]_{\mathcal{A}}) (Q_z z \in \text{pro} [z]) (\exists x_{\mathcal{E}} \in \text{pro} [x]_{\mathcal{E}}), (f(x) = z)$$

where  $Q_z = \exists$  if [z] is proper, and  $Q_z = \forall$  otherwise.



Example (Interpretation of the Kaucher multiplication in the case  $\mathcal{Z} \times \mathsf{dual} \ \mathcal{Z}$ )

$$\begin{split} &[z] = [x] \times [y] = 0 \text{ when } [x] \in \mathcal{Z} = \{[x], \ \underline{x} \leq 0 \leq \overline{x}\} \text{ (e.g. [-5,4]) and} \\ &[y] \in \mathsf{dual} \ \mathcal{Z} = \{[x], \ \underline{x} \geq 0 \geqslant \overline{x}\} \text{ (e.g. [1,-1])}. \end{split}$$

## Definition (reminder)

Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  and  $[x] \in I$  and  $[y] \in (\text{dual } I)$ . A generalized interval  $[z] \in K$  is  $(f, [x] \times [y])$ -interpretable if

 $(\forall x \in [x]) (Q_z z \in \text{pro} [z]) (\exists y \in [y]), (f(x, y) = x \times y = z)$ 

where  $Q_z = \exists$  if [z] is proper, and  $Q_z = \forall$  otherwise.



Example (Interpretation of the Kaucher multiplication in the case  $\mathcal{Z} \times dual \mathcal{Z}$ )

 $[z] = [x] \times [y] = 0$  when  $[x] \in \mathcal{Z} = \{[x], x \leq 0 \leq \overline{x}\}$  (e.g. [-5,4]) and  $[y] \in \mathsf{dual} \ \mathcal{Z} = \{[x], \ \underline{x} \ge 0 \ge \overline{x}\} \ (\mathsf{e.g.} \ [1,-1]).$ 

## Definition (reminder)

Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  and  $[x] \in I$  and  $[y] \in (dual I)$ . A generalized interval  $[z] \in K$  is  $(f, [x] \times [y])$ -interpretable if

 $(\forall x \in [x]) (\forall z \in \text{pro} [z]) (\exists y \in [y]), (f(x, y) = x \times y = z)$ 

where  $Q_z = \exists$  if [z] is proper, and  $Q_z = \forall$  otherwise.

#### Let us suppose [z] improper:

- computing  $[z] = [x] \times [y]$  consists in finding [z] such that  $\forall x \in [x], \forall z \in \text{pro} [z]$ ,  $\exists y \in \text{pro}[y], z = x \times y$ :
- instanciating the property for  $0 \in [x]$ , we get  $\forall z \in \text{pro}[z]$ ,  $(\exists y \in \text{pro}[y]) | z = 0$ . Thus [z] is necessarily 0.

# Limitations of Kaucher and interval arithmetic

Kaucher arithmetic defines a generalized interval natural extension :

- Interpretable as outer approximation when all intervals are proper (interval arithmetic), but may be insufficiently accurate because of *dependency problem*
- Interpretable as inner approximation when all intervals are proper and f is given by an arithmetic expression with single occurences of variables

#### Example (dependency problem in outer approximation)

Let f(x) = x - x, then [f]([-1,1]) = [-1,1] - [-1,1] = [-2,2]

### Example (single-occurence limitation in inner approximation)

Let  $f(x) = x^2 - x$ , we want an inner approximation of range(f, [2, 3]). But due to the two occurrences of x, f([3, 2]) with Kaucher arithmetic is not (f, [x])-interpretable.

#### A solution: mean-value theorem & affine arithmetic

# Affine arithmetic (outer-approximation by zonotopes)

#### Affine form

For a quantity x :

$$\hat{x} = x_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \varepsilon_i, \text{ where } \forall i, x_i \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } \varepsilon_i \in [-1, 1].$$

 $\hat{x}$  takes its value in  $\left[x_0 - \sum_{i=1}^n |x_i|, x_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n |x_i|\right]$ .

### Zonotopes (joint range of affine forms)

Several forms for quantities  $x_i$ , sharing common noise symbols  $\varepsilon_j$ :

$$\hat{x}^{i} = x_{0}^{i} + x_{1}^{i}\varepsilon_{1} + \ldots + x_{n}^{i}\varepsilon_{n},$$



# Affine arithmetic (outer-approximation by zonotopes)

## Assignment x := [a, b]

Centered form using a fresh noise symbol  $\varepsilon_{n+1} \in [-1,1]$ ,

$$\hat{x} = \frac{(a+b)}{2} + \frac{(b-a)}{2} \varepsilon_{n+1}.$$

Affine operations (interpreted exactly; no new noise symbol)

For  $\lambda \in \mathbb{R}$ , we have

$$\lambda \hat{x} + \hat{y} = (\lambda x_0 + y_0) + \sum_{i=1}^n (\lambda x_i + y_i) \varepsilon_i.$$

#### Multiplication

Possible (simple) version of the multiplication (note the  $\eta_1$  noise symbol):

$$\hat{x}\hat{y} = x_0y_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n (x_iy_0 + y_ix_0)\varepsilon_i + \frac{1}{2}\sum_{1 \leq i,j \leq n} |x_iy_j + x_jy_i| \eta_1.$$

(and similar "linearizations" of non-linear operations)

## Generalized mean-value theorem

• To each component  $[x]_i$ , i = 1, ..., n of the input box  $[x] \in \mathbf{K}^n$ , associate  $\varepsilon_i$ , by

$$\hat{x}_i(\varepsilon_i) = \frac{\underline{x}_i + \overline{x}_i}{2} + \frac{\overline{x}_i - \underline{x}_i}{2}\varepsilon_i$$
, where  $[x]_i = [\underline{x}_i, \overline{x}_i]$ 

• Derive  $f^{\varepsilon}$  of the vector  $\varepsilon = (\varepsilon_1, \dots, \varepsilon_n)$  from  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$ , for some input  $[x] \in \mathbf{K}^n$ .

#### Generalized mean-value theorem

Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}$  be differentiable,  $[x] \in \mathbf{K}^n$ . Suppose  $\left\{ \frac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_i}(\varepsilon), \ \varepsilon \in [-1,1]^n \right\} \sqsubseteq [\Delta_i]$ . Then,  $\forall (t_1, \ldots, t_n) \in \text{pro } \varepsilon = [-1,1]^n$ ,

$$\widetilde{f}^{\varepsilon}([\varepsilon_1],\ldots,[\varepsilon_n])=f^{\varepsilon}(t_1,\ldots,t_n)+\sum_{i=1}^n[\Delta_i]([\varepsilon_i]-t_i),$$

is (f, [x])-interpretable. In particular,

- if  $\tilde{f}^{\varepsilon}([1, -1]^n)$ , computed with Kaucher arithmetic, is improper, then pro  $\tilde{f}^{\varepsilon}([1, -1]^n)$  is an inner approximation of  $\{f^{\varepsilon}(\varepsilon), \varepsilon \in [-1, 1]^n\} = \operatorname{range}(f, [x])$ .
- if  $\tilde{f}^{\varepsilon}([-1,1]^n)$  is proper, then it is an outer approximation of range(f,[x]).

### Generalized affine forms

• The generalized mean-value theorem defines generalized affine forms: for  $f:\mathbb{R}^n\to\mathbb{R},$ 

$$f^{\varepsilon}(t_1,\ldots,t_n)+\sum_{i=1}^n [\Delta_i]([\varepsilon_i]-t_i),$$

where 
$$\left\{ rac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_{i}}(\varepsilon), \ \varepsilon \in [-1,1]^{n} 
ight\} \sqsubseteq [\Delta_{i}].$$

• We want an inductive computation of these forms on arithmetic expressions



### Generalized affine forms

• The generalized mean-value theorem defines generalized affine forms: for  $f:\mathbb{R}^n\to\mathbb{R},$ 

$$f^{\varepsilon}(t_1,\ldots,t_n)+\sum_{i=1}^n [\Delta_i]([\varepsilon_i]-t_i),$$

where  $\left\{ rac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_{i}}(\varepsilon), \; \varepsilon \in [-1,1]^{n} 
ight\} \sqsubseteq [\Delta_{i}].$ 

• We want an inductive computation of these forms on arithmetic expressions

## Order 0 forms (SAS 2007)

- The partial derivatives  $[\Delta_i]$  are evaluated with intervals
- Example:  $f(x) = x^2 x$ ,  $x \in [2,3]$ , thus  $f^{\varepsilon}(\epsilon_1) = (2.5 + 0.5\epsilon_1)^2 (2.5 + 0.5\epsilon_1)$ . We get  $\tilde{f}^{\varepsilon}(\epsilon_1) = 3.75 + [1.5, 2.5]\epsilon_1$ , that can be interpreted as:

 $\textit{pro}(3.75 + [1.5, 2.5][1, -1]) \subseteq f([-1, 1]) \subseteq 3.75 + [1.5, 2.5][-1, 1]$ 

### Generalized affine forms

• The generalized mean-value theorem defines generalized affine forms: for  $f:\mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R},$ 

$$f^{\varepsilon}(t_1,\ldots,t_n)+\sum_{i=1}^n [\Delta_i]([\varepsilon_i]-t_i),$$

where  $\left\{ rac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_{i}}(\varepsilon), \; \varepsilon \in [-1,1]^{n} 
ight\} \sqsubseteq [\Delta_{i}].$ 

• We want an inductive computation of these forms on arithmetic expressions

### Order 0 forms (SAS 2007)

- The partial derivatives  $[\Delta_i]$  are evaluated with intervals
- Example:  $f(x) = x^2 x$ ,  $x \in [2,3]$ , thus  $f^{\varepsilon}(\epsilon_1) = (2.5 + 0.5\epsilon_1)^2 (2.5 + 0.5\epsilon_1)$ . We get  $\tilde{f}^{\varepsilon}(\epsilon_1) = 3.75 + [1.5, 2.5]\epsilon_1$ , that can be interpreted as:

$$pro(3.75 + [1.5, -1.5]) \subseteq f([-1, 1]) \subseteq 3.75 + [-2.5, 2.5]$$

#### Generalized affine forms

• The generalized mean-value theorem defines generalized affine forms: for  $f:\mathbb{R}^n\to\mathbb{R},$ 

$$f^{\varepsilon}(t_1,\ldots,t_n)+\sum_{i=1}^n [\Delta_i]([\varepsilon_i]-t_i),$$

where  $\left\{ \frac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_{i}}(\varepsilon), \ \varepsilon \in [-1,1]^{n} \right\} \sqsubseteq [\Delta_{i}].$ 

• We want an inductive computation of these forms on arithmetic expressions

### Order 0 forms (SAS 2007)

- The partial derivatives  $[\Delta_i]$  are evaluated with intervals
- Example:  $f(x) = x^2 x$ ,  $x \in [2,3]$ , thus  $f^{\varepsilon}(\epsilon_1) = (2.5 + 0.5\varepsilon_1)^2 (2.5 + 0.5\varepsilon_1)$ . We get  $\tilde{f}^{\varepsilon}(\varepsilon_1) = 3.75 + [1.5, 2.5]\varepsilon_1$ , that can be interpreted as:

$$pro([5.25, 4.25]) \subseteq f([-1, 1]) \subseteq [1.25, 6.25]$$



### Generalized affine forms

• The generalized mean-value theorem defines generalized affine forms: for  $f:\mathbb{R}^n\to\mathbb{R},$ 

$$f^{\varepsilon}(t_1,\ldots,t_n)+\sum_{i=1}^n [\Delta_i]([\varepsilon_i]-t_i),$$

where  $\left\{ rac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_{i}}(\varepsilon), \; \varepsilon \in [-1,1]^{n} 
ight\} \sqsubseteq [\Delta_{i}].$ 

• We want an inductive computation of these forms on arithmetic expressions

## Order 0 forms (SAS 2007)

- The partial derivatives  $[\Delta_i]$  are evaluated with intervals
- Example:  $f(x) = x^2 x$ ,  $x \in [2,3]$ , thus  $f^{\varepsilon}(\epsilon_1) = (2.5 + 0.5\varepsilon_1)^2 (2.5 + 0.5\varepsilon_1)$ . We get  $\tilde{f}^{\varepsilon}(\varepsilon_1) = 3.75 + [1.5, 2.5]\varepsilon_1$ , that can be interpreted as:

$$[4.25, 5.25] \subseteq f([-1, 1]) \subseteq [1.25, 6.25]$$

• Solves the single-occurence limitation but not quite the dependency problem

## Generalized affine forms

• The generalized mean-value theorem defines generalized affine forms: for  $f:\mathbb{R}^n\to\mathbb{R},$ 

$$f^{\varepsilon}(t_1,\ldots,t_n)+\sum_{i=1}^n[\Delta_i]([\varepsilon_i]-t_i),$$

where 
$$\left\{ \frac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_{i}}(\varepsilon), \ \varepsilon \in [-1,1]^{n} \right\} \sqsubseteq [\Delta_{i}].$$

• We want an inductive computation of these forms on arithmetic expressions

#### Here, order 1 generalized affine forms

- Inductive computations with zonotopic outer-approximations of quantities and partial derivatives  $\Delta_i$ : more precise that order 0
- When computing the inner range of a scalar function as above, we use only the interval range [Δ<sub>i</sub>]
- But in general we have  $f: \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}^p$  and thus vectors of generalized affine forms
- Order 1 forms code some dependency between the components of f or f<sup>ε</sup> : allows us to define joint inner range (see end of talk)

# First-order generalized affine vectors

#### Definition (first-order generalized vector)

A first-order generalized affine vector for  $x = (x_1, \ldots, x_p)$  is a triple  $(Z, c, J) \in \mathcal{M}(n + m + 1, p) \times \mathbb{R}^p \times (\mathcal{M}(n, p))^{n+m+1}$ :

- Column k of  $Z = {}^{t}(Z_0 Z_{\varepsilon} Z_{\eta})$  describes the affine form outer-approximating  $x_k$
- c is the center
- Element j<sub>i,k</sub> of J = <sup>t</sup>(J<sub>0</sub>J<sub>ε</sub>J<sub>η</sub>) describes the affine form outer-approximating <sup>∂x<sup>k</sup></sup>/<sub>∂ε<sub>i</sub></sub> (one of the previous Δ<sub>i</sub>: column k of J is an affine vector over-approximating <sup>∂x</sup>/<sub>∂ε<sub>i</sub></sub>)

#### Property

With matrix notations, a first-order generalized affine vector  $(Z, c, J) \in \mathcal{M}(n + m + 1, p) \times \mathbb{R}^{p} \times (\mathcal{M}(n, p))^{n+m+1}$  abstracts  $f : \mathbb{R}^{n} \to \mathbb{R}^{p}$ , if  $c = f^{\varepsilon}(0)$ and

$$(\forall \varepsilon \in [\varepsilon]) (\exists \eta \in [\eta]), \begin{cases} f^{\varepsilon}(\varepsilon) = {}^{t}Z_{0} + {}^{t}Z_{\varepsilon}\varepsilon + {}^{t}Z_{\eta}\eta \\ \frac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_{i}}(\varepsilon) = {}^{t}J_{i,0} + {}^{t}J_{i,\varepsilon}\varepsilon + {}^{t}J_{i,\eta}\eta, \forall i = 1, \dots, n \end{cases}$$
(1)

(Z, c, J) defines a simultaneous outer approximation of  $f^{\varepsilon}(\varepsilon)$  and  $(\frac{\partial f^{\varepsilon}}{\partial \varepsilon_{i}})_{i}(\varepsilon)$ , rely the same parametrization in the  $\varepsilon$  and  $\eta$  noise symbols.

E. Goubault, M. Kieffer, O. Mullier and S. Putot (LIX

Inner approximated reachability analysis

## Inductive construction of a sound abstraction: assignment

We now want to inductively build a sound abstraction of any arithmetic expression. Example: Consider assignments  $x_1 := [2, 3]$  and  $x_2 := [3, 4]$ .

• The affine forms outer approximating  $x_1$  and  $x_2$  are  $\hat{x}_1 = \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1$  and  $\hat{x}_2 = \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2$ , thus

$$\mathbf{Z} = \left(\begin{array}{cc} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 \end{array}\right)$$

- The centers are  $\mathbf{c} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} \end{pmatrix}$ .
- The Jacobian over-approximation is  $J = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{2} & 0\\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} \end{pmatrix}$

Assignment  $f'_{p+1} := [a, b]$  with a < b and corresponding new noise symbol  $\varepsilon_i$ 

If (Z, c, J) abstracts  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}^p$ , an abstraction of  $f' = (f, f'_{p+1} := [a, b]) : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}^{p+1}$  is

$$\begin{cases} Z' = \begin{pmatrix} Z & \frac{a+b}{2} + \frac{b-a}{2}\varepsilon_i \\ c' = \begin{pmatrix} c & \frac{a+b}{2} \end{pmatrix} \\ J' = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ J & \frac{b-a}{2} \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \leftarrow i\text{-th line} \end{cases}$$

E. Goubault, M. Kieffer, O. Mullier and S. Putot (LIX

## Inductive construction of a sound abstraction: affine operations

Example (Consider now  $x_3 := 3x_1 - x_2$ )

• The outer approx. of quantities  $x_i$  are  $Z = \left(\begin{array}{c} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & 4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 \end{array}\right)$ 

• The centers are 
$$\mathbf{c} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} & 4 \end{pmatrix}$$
.

• The Jacobian is 
$$J = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{2} & 0 & \frac{3}{2} \\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} & -\frac{-1}{2} \end{pmatrix}$$

Affine operations  $f' = (f, f'_{p+1} := \lambda_1 f_i + \lambda_2 f_j) : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}^{p+1}$ , where  $(\lambda_1, \lambda_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2$ 

$$\left\{ egin{array}{rcl} Z'&=&\left(egin{array}{ccc} Z&\lambda_1\hat{z}_i+\lambda_2\hat{z}_j \end{array}
ight)\ c'&=&\left(egin{array}{ccc} c&\lambda_1c_i+\lambda_2c_j \end{array}
ight)\ J'&=&\left(egin{array}{ccc} \lambda_1\hat{j}_{1,i}+\lambda_2\hat{j}_{1,j} \ J&ec{ec{z}} \end{array}
ight)\ J'&=&\left(egin{array}{ccc} \lambda_1\hat{j}_{1,i}+\lambda_2\hat{j}_{1,j} \ \lambda_1\hat{j}_{n,i}+\lambda_2\hat{j}_{n,j} \end{array}
ight) \end{array}$$

Affine operations are exact.

1

E. Goubault, M. Kieffer, O. Mullier and S. Putot (LIX

Inductive construction of a sound abstraction: multiplication

Example (Consider now  $x_4 := x_1 x_3$ )

• Values 
$$\hat{x}_4 = 10 + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{2}\varepsilon_2 + [-\frac{1}{4}, 1] = \frac{83}{8} + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{4}\varepsilon_2 + \frac{5}{8}\eta_1$$
  
 $Z = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & 4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & \frac{83}{8} + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{4}\varepsilon_2 + \frac{5}{8}\eta_1\end{array}\right)$   
• Center  $c = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} & 4 & 10\end{array}\right).$   
• Jacobian  $\hat{j}_{i4} = \hat{x}_1\hat{j}_{i3} + \hat{x}_3\hat{j}_{i1}, i = 1, \dots, 2$   
 $\hat{j}_{14} = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1\right)\frac{3}{2} + \left(4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2\right)\frac{1}{2} = \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_2$   
 $J = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{1}{2} & 0 & \frac{3}{2} & \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_2\\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} & -\frac{1}{2} & -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1\end{array}\right)$ 

Multiplication  $f' = (f, f'_{p+1} := f_i f_j) : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}^{p+1}$ 

$$\left\{\begin{array}{rrrr} Z' &=& \left(\begin{array}{cc} Z & \hat{z}_i \hat{z}_j \end{array}\right) \\ c' &=& \left(\begin{array}{cc} c & c_i c_j \end{array}\right) \\ J' &=& \left(\begin{array}{cc} & \hat{z}_j \hat{j}_{1,i} + \hat{z}_i \hat{j}_{1,j} \end{array}\right) \\ J & \vdots \\ & \hat{z}_j \hat{j}_{n,i} + \hat{z}_i \hat{j}_{n,j} \end{array}\right.$$

E. Goubault, M. Kieffer, O. Mullier and S. Putot (LIX

Inner approximated reachability analysis

$$Z = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & 4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & \frac{83}{4} + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{4}\varepsilon_2 + \frac{5}{8}\eta_1 \end{array}\right)$$
$$c = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} & 4 & 10 \end{array}\right) \quad J = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{1}{2} & 0 & \frac{3}{2} & \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_2 \\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} & -\frac{7}{2} & -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1 \end{array}\right)$$

Inner-approximation of the range of  $x_3(x_1, x_2)$  and  $x_4(x_1, x_2)$  for  $(x_1, x_2) \in [2, 3] \times [3, 4]$  $\forall k = 1 \dots 4, pro(c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][1, -1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}][1, -1]) \subseteq [x_k] \subseteq c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][-1, 1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}] * [-1, 1])$ 

- ullet Uses Kaucher multiplication rule  $[x]\times [y]$  for  $[y]=[1,-1]\in {\sf dual}\ {\mathcal Z}$
- Note that if a jacobian coefficient contains zero, the corresponding multiplication is zero (rule  $Z \times dual Z = 0$ )
- Exact for x<sub>3</sub> (affine operations only):

$$pro(4 + \frac{3}{2}[1, -1] - \frac{1}{2}[1, -1]) \subseteq range(x_3, [2, 3] \times [3, 4]) \subseteq 4 + \frac{3}{2}[1, -1] - \frac{1}{2}[1, -1]$$

1

$$Z = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & 4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & \frac{83}{4} + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{4}\varepsilon_2 + \frac{5}{8}\eta_1 \end{array}\right)$$
$$c = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} & 4 & 10 \end{array}\right) \quad J = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{1}{2} & 0 & \frac{3}{2} & \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_2 \\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} & -\frac{1}{2} & -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1 \end{array}\right)$$

Inner-approximation of the range of  $x_3(x_1, x_2)$  and  $x_4(x_1, x_2)$  for  $(x_1, x_2) \in [2, 3] \times [3, 4]$  $\forall k = 1 \dots 4, pro(c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][1, -1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}][1, -1]) \subseteq [x_k] \subseteq c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][-1, 1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}] * [-1, 1])$ 

- $\bullet~$  Uses Kaucher multiplication rule  $[x]\times [y]$  for  $[y]=[1,-1]\in \mathsf{dual}~\mathcal{Z}$
- Note that if a jacobian coefficient contains zero, the corresponding multiplication is zero (rule  $Z \times dual Z = 0$ )
- Exact for x<sub>3</sub> (affine operations only):

$$pro(4 + [\frac{3}{2}, -\frac{3}{2}] + [\frac{1}{2}, -\frac{1}{2}]) \subseteq range(x_3, [2, 3] \times [3, 4]) \subseteq 4 + [-\frac{3}{2}, \frac{3}{2}] + [-\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}]$$

/ `

$$Z = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & 4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & \frac{83}{4} + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{4}\varepsilon_2 + \frac{5}{8}\eta_1 \end{array}\right)$$
$$c = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} & 4 & 10 \end{array}\right) \quad J = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{1}{2} & 0 & \frac{3}{2} & \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_2 \\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} & -\frac{1}{2} & -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1 \end{array}\right)$$

Inner-approximation of the range of  $x_3(x_1, x_2)$  and  $x_4(x_1, x_2)$  for  $(x_1, x_2) \in [2, 3] \times [3, 4]$  $\forall k = 1 \dots 4, pro(c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][1, -1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}][1, -1]) \subseteq [x_k] \subseteq c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][-1, 1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}] * [-1, 1])$ 

- $\bullet~$  Uses Kaucher multiplication rule  $[x]\times [y]$  for  $[y]=[1,-1]\in {\sf dual}~{\mathcal Z}$
- Note that if a jacobian coefficient contains zero, the corresponding multiplication is zero (rule  $Z \times dual Z = 0$ )
- Exact for x<sub>3</sub> (affine operations only):

$$[2,6] = \textit{pro}([6,2]) \subseteq \textit{range}(x_3, [2,3] \times [3,4]) \subseteq [2,6]$$

E. Goubault, M. Kieffer, O. Mullier and S. Putot (LIX

$$\begin{aligned} Z &= \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & 4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & \frac{83}{3} + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{4}\varepsilon_2 + \frac{5}{8}\eta_1 \end{array}\right) \\ c &= \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} & 4 & 10 \end{array}\right) \quad J = \left(\begin{array}{ccc} \frac{1}{2} & 0 & \frac{3}{2} & \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_2 \\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} & -\frac{1}{2} & -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1 \end{array}\right) \end{aligned}$$

Inner-approximation of the range of  $x_3(x_1, x_2)$  and  $x_4(x_1, x_2)$  for  $(x_1, x_2) \in [2, 3] \times [3, 4]$ 

 $orall k = 1 \dots 4, pro(c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][1, -1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}][1, -1]) \subseteq [x_k] \subseteq c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][-1, 1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}] * [-1, 1])$ 

- Uses Kaucher multiplication rule  $[x] \times [y]$  for  $[y] = [1, -1] \in \mathsf{dual}\ \mathcal{Z}$
- Note that if a jacobian coefficient contains zero, the corresponding multiplication is zero (rule  $Z \times dual Z = 0$ )
- Exact for x<sub>3</sub> (affine operations only):

$$[2,6] = pro([6,2]) \subseteq range(x_3, [2,3] \times [3,4]) \subseteq [2,6]$$

• for x<sub>4</sub>: 
$$[\hat{j}_{14} = \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2] \in [4, \frac{15}{2}]$$
 and  $[\hat{j}_{24} = -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1] \in [-\frac{3}{2}, -1]$ 

$$pro(10+[4, \frac{15}{2}][1, -1]+[-\frac{3}{2}, -1][1, -1]) \subseteq [x_4] \subseteq 10+[4, \frac{15}{2}][-1, 1]+[-\frac{3}{2}, -1][-1, 1]$$

$$Z = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & 4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & \frac{83}{4} + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{4}\varepsilon_2 + \frac{5}{8}\eta_1 \end{pmatrix}$$
$$c = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} & 4 & 10 \end{pmatrix} \quad J = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{2} & 0 & \frac{3}{2} & \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_2 \\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} & -\frac{1}{2} & -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1 \end{pmatrix}$$

Inner-approximation of the range of  $x_3(x_1, x_2)$  and  $x_4(x_1, x_2)$  for  $(x_1, x_2) \in [2, 3] \times [3, 4]$ 

 $orall k = 1 \dots 4, pro(c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][1, -1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}][1, -1]) \subseteq [x_k] \subseteq c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][-1, 1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}] * [-1, 1])$ 

- Uses Kaucher multiplication rule  $[x] \times [y]$  for  $[y] = [1, -1] \in \mathsf{dual}\ \mathcal{Z}$
- Note that if a jacobian coefficient contains zero, the corresponding multiplication is zero (rule  $Z \times dual Z = 0$ )
- Exact for x<sub>3</sub> (affine operations only):

$$[2,6] = pro([6,2]) \subseteq range(x_3, [2,3] \times [3,4]) \subseteq [2,6]$$

• for x<sub>4</sub>: 
$$[\hat{j}_{14} = \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2] \in [4, \frac{15}{2}]$$
 and  $[\hat{j}_{24} = -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1] \in [-\frac{3}{2}, -1]$ :  
 $pro(10 + [4, -4] + [1, -1]) \subseteq [x_4] \subseteq 10 + [-\frac{15}{2}, \frac{15}{2}] + [-\frac{3}{2}, \frac{3}{2}]$ 

$$Z = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{5}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_1 & \frac{7}{2} + \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & 4 + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2 & \frac{83}{4} + \frac{23}{4}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{5}{4}\varepsilon_2 + \frac{5}{8}\eta_1 \end{pmatrix}$$
$$c = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{5}{2} & \frac{7}{2} & 4 & 10 \end{pmatrix} \quad J = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{2} & 0 & \frac{3}{2} & \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_2 \\ 0 & \frac{1}{2} & -\frac{1}{2} & -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1 \end{pmatrix}$$

Inner-approximation of the range of  $x_3(x_1, x_2)$  and  $x_4(x_1, x_2)$  for  $(x_1, x_2) \in [2, 3] \times [3, 4]$ 

 $\forall k = 1 \dots 4, \textit{pro}(c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][1, -1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}][1, -1]) \subseteq [x_k] \subseteq c_k + [\hat{j}_{1k}][-1, 1] + [\hat{j}_{2k}] * [-1, 1])$ 

- Uses Kaucher multiplication rule  $[x] \times [y]$  for  $[y] = [1, -1] \in \mathsf{dual}\ \mathcal{Z}$
- Note that if a jacobian coefficient contains zero, the corresponding multiplication is zero (rule  $Z \times dual Z = 0$ )
- Exact for x<sub>3</sub> (affine operations only):

$$[2,6] = pro([6,2]) \subseteq range(x_3, [2,3] \times [3,4]) \subseteq [2,6]$$

• for 
$$x_4$$
:  $[\hat{j}_{14} = \frac{23}{4} + \frac{3}{2}\varepsilon_1 - \frac{1}{2}\varepsilon_2] \in [4, \frac{15}{2}]$  and  $[\hat{j}_{24} = -\frac{5}{4} - \frac{1}{4}\varepsilon_1] \in [-\frac{3}{2}, -1]$ :

$$[5,15]\subseteq [x_4]\subseteq [1,19]$$

# Joint inner range of a vector function

Algorithm to compute a set of boxes proved to be in the image of f:

- Based on input set bisection + a sufficient condition for a box  $\tilde{y}$  to be in range $(f, \mathbf{x})$ .
- Only needs an outer approximation of the Jacobian of f
- Goldzstejn-Jaulin 2010 ( $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}^n$ ), MGKP 2013 (extension  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \mathbb{R}^p$ )



## Characterization of the joint inner range of order 1 affine vectors: example

#### Example

Let  $x = (x_1, x_2) \in [2, 3] \times [3, 4]$  and

$$f(x) = \begin{pmatrix} x_1^3 - 2x_1x_2 \\ x_2^3 - 2x_1x_2 \end{pmatrix}$$

Joint inner range of the corresponding order 1 affine vectors (see paper for computation and inner range of components : costly but rarely needed



E. Goubault, M. Kieffer, O. Mullier and S. Putot (LIX

# Implementation and experiments

- Order 0 and order 1 affine vectors implemented as an abstract domain in the Apron library for static analysis (http://apron.cri.ensmp.fr/library)
  - calls the Taylor1+ abstract domain [Ghorbal-Goubault-Putot 2009, 2010] for zonotopic over-approximation
  - available at http://www.lix.polytechnique.fr/Labo/Sylvie.Putot/hscc14.html
  - joint inner approximation as a separate prototype
- Application to the reachability of (discrete) dynamical systems



# Example: a Newton algorithm

Consider  $x(k + 1) = 2x(k) - ax(k)^2$ , for  $a \in [1.95, 2.]$  and x(0) = 0.6, iterated until  $|x(k + 1) - x(k)| < 5.10^{-4}$ . This iteration should converge to 1/a.

Outer approximation: the stopping criterion of the loop is always satisfied after 4 iterations (|x(4) - x(3)| ⊆ [-2.610<sup>-4</sup>, 2.610<sup>-4</sup>]).



## Example: a Newton algorithm

Consider  $x(k+1) = 2x(k) - ax(k)^2$ , for  $a \in [1.95, 2.]$  and x(0) = 0.6, iterated until  $|x(k+1) - x(k)| < 5.10^{-4}$ . This iteration should converge to 1/a.

- Outer approximation: the stopping criterion of the loop is always satisfied after 4 iterations (|x(4) x(3)| ⊆ [-2.6 10<sup>-4</sup>, 2.6 10<sup>-4</sup>]).
- Inner approximation: there exist some inputs for which the criterion is not satisfied for the first 3 iterations (for instance,  $[-7.710^{-4}, -4.110^{-4}] \subseteq x(3) x(2)$ ).
- When the criterion is satisfied, [.4999244, .5127338] ⊆ x(4) ⊆ [0.499831, 0.512906].



## Example: a Newton algorithm

Consider  $x(k+1) = 2x(k) - ax(k)^2$ , for  $a \in [1.95, 2.]$  and x(0) = 0.6, iterated until  $|x(k+1) - x(k)| < 5.10^{-4}$ . This iteration should converge to 1/a.

- Outer approximation: the stopping criterion of the loop is always satisfied after 4 iterations (|x(4) x(3)| ⊆ [-2.6 10<sup>-4</sup>, 2.6 10<sup>-4</sup>]).
- Inner approximation: there exist some inputs for which the criterion is not satisfied for the first 3 iterations (for instance,  $[-7.710^{-4}, -4.110^{-4}] \subseteq x(3) x(2)$ ).
- When the criterion is satisfied, [.4999244, .5127338] ⊆ x(4) ⊆ [0.499831, 0.512906].



# Example: good behaviour on this highly non linear Householder iteration

$$x(k+1) = x(k) + x(k) \left(\frac{1}{2}h(k) + \frac{3}{8}h(k)^2\right)$$

with  $h(k) = 1 - ax(k)^2$  and  $a \in [16, 20]$ , starting from  $x(0) = [\frac{1}{20}, \frac{1}{16}]$ .



Comparable accuracy of inner and outer approximations, and stability along iterations.

Reachability of discrete dynamical systems: FitzHugh-Nagumo neuron model (100 iterates of Euler time-discretization scheme)

$$\begin{cases} x_1(k+1) = x_1(k) + h\left(x_1(k) - \frac{x_1(k)^3}{3} - x_2(k) + \frac{7}{8}\right) \\ x_2(k+1) = x_2(k) + h\left(0.08(x_1(k) + 0.7 - 0.8x_2(k))\right) \end{cases}$$

where h = 0.2, and  $(x_1(0), x_2(0)) = [1, 1.25] \times [2.25, 2.5]$ .



E. Goubault, M. Kieffer, O. Mullier and S. Putot (LIX

- Inner approximation scheme
  - order of accuracy of outer approximated zonotopes
  - cost remains linear with respect to over-approximated zonotopes
- Reachability analysis of continuous dynamical systems
  - in the paper, indirect method by over approximation of the Jacobian by Taylor Models
  - direct set integration (work in progress)
- Reachability analysis of hybrid systems: interpretation of guard conditions (work in progress)
  - in the paper (HSCC 2014), first ideas for inner approximation of the range of noise symbols in order to satisfy the constraints, instead of the [-1,1] ranges

